



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

April 27, 2015

## MEMORANDUM TO THE WESTERN NEW YORK POWER PROCEEDS ALLOCATION BOARD

FROM THE WESTERN NEW YORK REGIONAL DIRECTOR, EMPIRE STATE  
DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

**SUBJECT: Applications for Fund Benefits from the Western New York  
Economic Development Fund**

### SUMMARY

The Western New York Power Proceeds Allocation Board (“Allocation Board” or “Board”) is requested to recommend to the Board of Trustees of the Power Authority of the State of New York (“NYPA” or “Authority”) that awards of Fund Benefits be made to the applicants identified in Exhibit “A” (“Buffalo Niagara Enterprise, Inc.”) (“BNE”), and Exhibit “B” (“Cambria Asphalt Products, Inc.”) (“CAP”) in the amounts indicated on such Exhibits.

### BACKGROUND

#### 1. Western New York Power Proceeds Allocation Act

On March 30, 2012, Governor Cuomo signed into law the Western New York Power Proceeds Allocation Act (the “Act”). The Act provides for the creation, by the Authority, of the Western New York Economic Development Fund (“Fund”). The Fund consists of the aggregate excess of revenues received by the Authority from the sale of Expansion Power (“EP”) and Replacement Power (“RP”) produced at NYPA’s Niagara Power Project that was sold in the wholesale energy market over what revenues would have been received had such energy been sold on a firm basis to an eligible EP or RP customer under the applicable tariff or contract.

Under the Act, an “eligible applicant” is a private business, including a not-for-profit corporation. “Eligible projects” is defined to mean “economic development projects by eligible applicants that are physically located within the state of New York within a thirty mile radius of the Niagara power project located in Lewiston, New York that will support the growth of business in the state and thereby lead to the creation or maintenance of jobs and tax revenues for the state and local governments.” Eligible projects include, for example, capital investments in buildings, equipment, and associated infrastructure owned by an eligible applicant for fund benefits; transportation projects under state or federally approved plans; the acquisition of land needed for infrastructure; research and development where the results of such research and

development will directly benefit New York state; support for tourism and marketing and advertising efforts for western New York state tourism and business; and energy-related projects.

Eligible projects do not include public interest advertising or advocacy; lobbying; the support or opposition of any candidate for public office; the support or opposition to any public issue; legal fees related to litigation of any kind; expenses related to administrative proceedings before state or local agencies; or retail businesses as defined by the board, including without limitation, sports venues, gaming and gambling or entertainment-related establishments, residential properties, or places of overnight accommodation.

Fund Benefits have been provided to successful eligible applicants in the form of grants. It is anticipated that Fund Benefits will be disbursed as reimbursement for expenses incurred by an Eligible Applicant for an Eligible Project, or for proposed eligible expenditures to be incurred by the eligible applicant for an eligible project when NYPA has authorized advance disbursements.

At least 15% percent of the Fund is dedicated to eligible projects which are “energy-related projects, programs and services,” which is defined as “energy efficiency projects and services, clean energy technology projects and services, and high performance and sustainable building programs and services, and the construction, installation and/or operation of facilities or equipment done in connection with any such projects, programs or services.”

Allocations of Fund Benefits may only be made on the basis of moneys that have been deposited in the Fund. No award may encumber funds that have not been deposited in the Fund.

## 2. Western New York Power Proceeds Allocation Board

Under the Act, the Allocation Board is charged with soliciting applications for Fund Benefits, reviewing applications, making eligibility determinations, evaluating the merits of applications for Fund Benefits, and making recommendations to NYPA on Fund Benefit awards. The Allocation Board uses the criteria applicable to EP, RP and PP allocations, and for revitalization of industry, provided for in Public Authorities Law § 1005. Additionally, the Board is authorized to consider the extent to which an award of Fund Benefits is consistent with the strategies and priorities of the Regional Economic Development Council having responsibility for the region in which an eligible project is proposed.

At its meeting on March 4, 2013, the Board, in accordance with the Act, adopted by-laws, operating procedures, guidelines related to the application, and a form of application. A copy of the relevant criteria (collectively, “Program Criteria”), adapted from this Board’s “Procedures for the Review of Applications for Fund Benefits,” is attached as Exhibit “D” to this memorandum.

The Board also defined “retail business” to mean “a business that is primarily used in making retail sales of goods or services to customers who personally visit such facilities to obtain goods or services.”

Finally, the Board designated the Western New York Regional Director for Empire State Development (“ESD”) to act on its behalf for administrative matters and along with NYPA, to provide staff services (“Staff”). Among other things, Staff was authorized to perform analyses of applications seeking Fund Benefits and to make recommendations to the Board on the applications.

### 3. Application Process

Initially, the Allocation Board established a series of application due dates coupled with a schedule of dates through the end of 2015 on which dates the Board expected to meet to consider applications. In addition, the application process was promoted through a media release and with assistance from state and local entities, including the Western New York and Finger Lakes Regional Economic Development Councils, ESD and local and regional economic development organizations within the State. A webpage was created that is hosted on WWW.NYPA.GOV/WNYPPAB with application instructions, a link to the approved application form and other program details including a contact phone number and email address staffed by the Western New York Empire State Development regional office.

In this eleventh round, the Allocation Board has before it four applications. Staff analyzed the applications and is now making recommendations to the Board on these applications.

## DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE BOARD

Staff has reviewed the applications received during the eleventh solicitation round, and is making the following recommendations to the Board.

### 1. Recommendations for Awards of Fund Benefits

The BNE application indicates that the total amount to be expended on the project by the applicant is approximately \$241,919.

The CAP application is being submitted under the “Business Investment” funding track. The application indicates that the total amount to be expended on the project is approximately \$606,000.

Based on a review of these applications and consideration of relevant Program Criteria, Staff recommends that the Allocation Board recommend to the NYPA Trustees that the applications receive an award of Fund Benefits in the amount indicated on Exhibit “A” and Exhibit “B”.

Staff has been advised that CAP’s application may propose a project that must receive approvals and/or comply with other legal requirements, such as the State Environmental Quality Review Act, before it may proceed. Staff recommends that any affirmative recommendation by the Board for such project not be forwarded to the NYPA Board of Trustees for action until after

the Board receives appropriate notification that all such approvals and requirements have been satisfied, and that such recommendations be made subject to further consideration by the Board in the event that such approvals and/or legal requirements are not satisfied.

2. Applications for Future Consideration

---

The Board is also requested to defer the applications listed on Exhibit “C” for future consideration to allow staff more time to evaluate them.

PROJECT STATUS

Under the Act, recommendations for Fund Benefits by the Allocation Board are a prerequisite to an award of Fund Benefits by NYPA. Upon a showing of good cause, NYPA has discretion to adopt the Allocation Board’s recommendations or to award Fund Benefits in different amounts or on different terms than recommended by the Board. In addition, the Authority is authorized to include in any contract providing for the implementation of an award (“Award Contract”) any terms and conditions that NYPA deems appropriate.

Given the preliminary stage of the projects identified in Exhibit “A” and Exhibit “B”, Staff is not in a position to recommend definitive terms and conditions that should be included in any Board recommendation for an award, but the Exhibits do list some potential terms and conditions for NYPA’s consideration. It is anticipated that NYPA staff, in consultation with Staff, would negotiate final terms and conditions if an award is made after the receipt of more detailed information concerning the project.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing discussion and information, Staff recommends that the Allocation Board:

1. Recommend to the NYPA Board of Trustees that the applicants listed in Exhibit “A” and Exhibit “B” receive an award of Fund Benefits in the amounts recommended in the Exhibits for the projects proposed; and
  2. Defer consideration of the applications listed in Exhibit “C” for a later time.
- 

For the reasons stated, Staff recommends the adoption of the above-requested action by adoption of a resolution in the form of the attached draft resolution.

Christopher Schoepflin  
Western New York Regional Director,  
Empire State Development Corporation

Att.

## **RESOLUTION**

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That the Western New York Power Proceeds Allocation Board (“Allocation Board”) hereby recommends that the Power Authority of the State of New York (“NYPA”) grant an award of Fund Benefits to the applicants listed in Exhibit “A” and Exhibit “B” in the amounts recommended therein, for the reasons set forth in the attached memorandum and the attachments thereto; provided that (i) if an application proposes a project that must receive approvals and/or comply with other legal requirements, such as the State Environmental Quality Review Act, before it may proceed, the recommendation for such application shall not be forwarded to NYPA until Staff, on behalf of the Board, receives appropriate notification that such legal approvals and/or requirements which are necessary for the project(s) to proceed have been satisfied, and (ii) such recommendations shall be subject to further Board review in the event that such approvals and/or legal requirements are not satisfied; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Allocation Board hereby finds and determines that the applications listed on Exhibit “C” will be deferred for consideration at a later time; and be it further

RESOLVED, That Staff is authorized on behalf of the Allocation Board to transmit the Board’s decision and recommendations to NYPA subject to the qualification stated above regarding legal approvals and/or requirements, and to do any and all things and take any and all actions to effectuate the Board’s decision and the foregoing resolution.



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT A

Applicant Name:	Buffalo Niagara Enterprise, Inc.	REDC Region:	WNY
Project Type:	Other-Workforce Study	County:	Erie
Industry:	Not-for-Profit	Locality:	City of Buffalo
Amount Requested:	\$65,836	Start Date:	July 2015
		Finish Date:	March 2016
<b>RECOMMENDED OFFER</b>			
Recommended Total Award:	\$65,836		
Total Project Cost:	\$241,919		
% of Project Cost Recommended:	27 %		
<b>PROJECT BUDGET-</b> Each component below includes costs related to production, project management and administrative support.			
<b>Use of funds</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Source of Funds</b>	<b>Amount</b>
Availability of Labor	\$21,385	Potential: National Grid	\$120,000
Quality of Labor	\$26,665	Potential: BUDC	\$28,042
Workforce development	\$49,567	Potential: Buffalo Building Trades	\$28,041
Skills Gap	\$21,385	WNYPPAB	\$65,836
Underemployment	\$44,451		
Labor/ Management Relations	\$42,395		
Payroll Costs	\$19,241		
Other Labor Costs	\$16,830		
<b>Total:</b>	<b>\$241,919</b>	<b>Total:</b>	<b>\$241,919</b>
<b>REGIONAL IMPACT MEASUREMENTS</b>			
Number of Jobs Retained:	0		
Number of Jobs Created:	0		
Average Salary of Jobs:	N/A		
Indirect Jobs Created:	0		



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT A

<p>Other Impact:</p>	<p>The project will identify strengths, skill sets, costs etc. in the regional labor market that can be promoted for the attraction of firms to the area. The goal of the project is to better position the region to meet the challenges of the future through a well-trained labor force.</p>
<p><b>PROJECT DESCRIPTION (Adapted from Application)</b></p>	
<p>In 2010, the Buffalo Niagara Enterprise, Inc. (“BNE”) released a comprehensive labor market study called <i>Buffalo Niagara 2010 Who’s Your Economy?</i> The six-month study was conducted by the University of Buffalo Regional Institute (“UBRI”) and assessed the region’s labor market to yield insights on strategies for attracting new businesses to the region, improving workforce training and aligning labor supply and demand.</p> <p>This project will update and expand upon the body of work completed in 2010 with a focus on emerging trends and developments, implications for labor demand, workforce readiness, regional economic competitiveness and growth. This work will engage experts and stakeholders representing employers, workforce development groups, organized labor and human resources, to provide insights on scope and research approach.</p> <p>Headquartered in Buffalo, the geographic scope of BNE’s work will be the eight counties of Western New York, with an in-depth look at county-by-county comparisons for selected analyses, including differences in labor force size and composition, workforce skill and educational attainment levels, the generation of new labor, wages and other payroll costs.</p> <p>More broadly, the study will include the following key components:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Availability of Labor</li> <li>• Quality of Labor</li> <li>• Workforce Development</li> <li>• The Skills Gap</li> <li>• Underemployment</li> <li>• Labor/Management Relations</li> <li>• Payroll and Other Costs</li> </ul>	



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT A

OTHER ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BENEFITS RECEIVED			
ESD:	\$ N/A	NYPA:	\$ N/A
IDA:	\$ N/A	Other: N/A	\$
PREVIOUS STATE ASSISTANCE OFFERED OR PROVIDED			
TYPE	AMOUNT	STATUS	
ESD: For 12 other projects (2000-2009)	\$3,282,000	Closed	

BASIS FOR RECOMMENDATION
<p>The availability of current and local labor data is critical when responding to labor related questions from prospective companies. BNE uses labor data in nearly every attraction project the organization manages. Because BNE makes the information available on its website, it has realized hundreds of page views for the 2010 UBRI study since July 2013. The 2010 edition of the UBRI study was also cited in a report done by The Partnership for the Public Good, Cornell University College of Architecture, Art, and Planning and the Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority.</p> <p>An updated labor market assessment will provide workforce development organizations an in-depth analysis of short and long-term job projections by target industry, the number of graduates the region's schools produce to fill these jobs, potential gaps that exist between demand for labor and supply, and typical career pathways for the region's seven high-growth target industries. It will also provide the number underemployed workers in the region, and demonstrate the kinds of skills, educational levels and experience such workers offer potential employers. This information will allow workforce development organizations to determine what types of training will be necessary for the region's workforce to fill the jobs expected in the future.</p>



## Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

### Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

#### EXHIBIT A

##### DISBURSEMENT TERMS

It is anticipated that Fund Benefits would be used to reimburse the applicant for the Skills Gap (\$21,385) and Underemployment (\$44,451) sections of a new labor market study. (The Underemployment section was last updated in 2006 and funded by NYS at a cost of \$100,000). Funds would be disbursed in lump sum as reimbursement upon project completion and as evidenced by attainment of a final copy of the Regional Labor Market Assessment, a final copy of the Wage and Salary Report and other documentation verifying project expenditures of approximately \$241,919.



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT B

Applicant Name:	Cambria Asphalt Products, Inc.	REDC Region:	WNY
Project Type:	Business Investment	County:	Niagara
Industry:	Manufacturing	Locality:	Town of Cambria
Amount Requested:	\$121,200	Start Date:	June 2015
		Finish Date:	August 2015
<b>RECOMMENDED OFFER</b>			
Recommended Total Award:	\$ 72,750		
Total Project Cost:	\$ 606,000		
% of Project Cost Recommended:	12%		
<b>PROJECT BUDGET-</b>			
<b>Use of funds</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Source of Funds</b>	<b>Amount</b>
Installation of pipeline to CAP's property	\$531,000	Committed: NYSEG	\$21,000
Installation of metering & connection to M & E	\$ 75,000	Committed: Cambria Asphalt	\$151,500
		Potential: M& T Line of Credit	\$312,300
		WNYPPAB	\$121,200
<b>Total:</b>	<b>\$606,000</b>	<b>Total:</b>	<b>\$606,000</b>
<b>REGIONAL IMPACT MEASUREMENTS</b>			
Number of Jobs Retained (Cambria Asphalt Products, Inc.):	2		
Number of Jobs Created (Cambria Asphalt Products, Inc.):	1		
Number of Jobs Retained (Shelby Stone Trucking - affiliate):	4		
Average Salary of Jobs:	\$42,485		
Indirect Jobs Created:	0		
Other Impact:			



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT B

<b>PROJECT DESCRIPTION (Adapted from Application)</b>			
<p>Cambria Asphalt Products, Inc. (CAP) is a produces hot mix asphalt products for the greater Niagara County Area. CAP supplies high quality asphalt roadway products to local municipalities and contractors. CAP currently uses high cost, low efficiency waste oil as a heating fuel to dry stone aggregate for producing hot mix asphalt. CAP plans to install a new natural gas pipeline to its Lockport Junction Road facility that will permit the company to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lower costs to produce hot mix asphalt, making CAP more price competitive;</li> <li>• Replace difficult to source waste oil with more abundant natural gas, which may reduce lost sales opportunities when waste oil supplies are low;</li> <li>• Improve plant emissions.</li> </ul> <p>The project will consist of pipeline installation across a number of properties to CAP’s facility, and costs related to metering and connection to the company’s machinery and equipment.</p>			
<b>OTHER ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BENEFITS RECEIVED</b>			
ESD:	\$ N/A	NYPA:	\$ N/A
IDA:	\$ N/A	Other: N/A	\$
<b>PREVIOUS STATE ASSISTANCE OFFERED OR PROVIDED</b>			
TYPE	AMOUNT	STATUS	



# Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board

## Western New York Economic Development Fund Recommendation Memo

### EXHIBIT B

<b>BASIS FOR RECOMMENDATION</b>
The profitability of small manufacturing companies is strongly dependent on the efficiency of operations. The project that has been proposed by CAP is expected to lower production costs, thus improving the company's competitiveness. CAP is among the few hot mix asphalt producers in WNY not currently using natural gas as a heating element. The proposed pipeline would serve to enhance productivity and growth potential, create sustainability, and ultimately increase profits. As natural gas burns cleaner than waste oil, the project will also help reduce emissions. Finally, the project will support the creation and retention of jobs in WNY.
<b>DISBURSEMENT TERMS</b>
It is anticipated that Fund Benefits would be used to reimburse the applicant for a portion of costs associated with the installation of pipeline to CAP's property. Funds would be disbursed in lump sum as reimbursement upon project completion, as evidenced by documentation verifying (i) project completion, (ii) project expenditures of approximately \$606,000, and (iii) the retention of six jobs and the creation of one job.

**Applications Deferred for Further Analysis**

<b>Line</b>	<b>Business</b>	<b>Classification</b>
1	Center for Employment Opportunities "CEO"	Deferred for further analysis
2	Buffalo and Erie County Development Corporation (Bethlehem Steel)	Deferred for further analysis

**Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board**

---

Criteria adapted from the Western NY Power Proceeds Allocation Board's  
"Procedures for the Review of Applications for Fund Benefits"

---

1. The extent to which an award of Fund Benefits would be consistent with the strategies and priorities of the Regional Economic Development Council ("REDC") having responsibility for the region in which an Eligible Project is located.<sup>1</sup> The Western New York Regional Economic Development Council which is responsible for Eligible Projects in Erie and Niagara Counties Strategies & Priorities are:
  - Promote "Smart Growth" by investing in areas that infrastructure already exists and achieves certain goals, such as: preserving historic buildings; reviving downtowns; reviving main streets; investing in existing neighborhoods; and investing in former industrial sites. A project consistent with Smart Growth will also focus on: enhancing walkability; enhancing multiple modes of transportation; connecting disadvantaged communities to employment clusters; spurring mixed-use private investment in existing communities and preserving/enhancing natural lands and or resources.
  - Promote workforce development by increasing diversity in the labor force, developing and cultivating that includes workers with advancement potential, underemployed, unemployed and special population; align education and skills training to job market for current and future industry needs.
  - Foster entrepreneurship and new business formation and growth. Designing a plan that brings new technologies and/or products to the marketplace, increases new startups in strategic industries and facilitates the commercialization of products that can lead to job growth in the Region.
  - Increase the industry profile of agriculture in WNY by: creating better access to markets; creating new products; creating new more efficient processes; creating strong regional brands; creating programs that promote careers in agriculture.
  - Utilize Western New York's proximity to Canadian and U.S. population centers to advance economic development in WNY. Bi-national projects will: utilize cross-

---

<sup>1</sup> As provided for in EDL § 189-c(4), criteria 2-15 are adapted from the criteria for eligibility for Expansion Power, Replacement Power and Preservation Power under Public Authorities Law § 1005. The specific criteria identified in PAL § 1005(13)(b)(4)-(5) are relevant to power allocations under these programs but do not have any logical application to allocations of Fund Benefits. Therefore, the Board does not expect to use these criteria to evaluate applications for Fund Benefits. Additionally, in accordance with PAL § 1005(13), criteria 13-15 listed herein will only be used in the case of Eligible Projects which are proposed by Applicants as, and determined by the Board to be, "revitalization" projects.

---

border planning to create transportation and logistical infrastructure; improve operational relationships; promote the attractiveness of WNY as a hub for global trade.

- Position the WNY region as a global energy hub through new sources of clean energy, energy efficiency and energy efficient transportation.
- Support growth of advanced manufacturing by making research more available to manufacturers to help them innovate.
- Spur growth in the health and life sciences industry through improved commercialization, recruit high profile research talent and reducing the cost burden of healthcare while improving health outcomes.
- Expand the scope of higher education by increasing accessibility to Higher Education for communities that currently have limited access to educational opportunities; better aligning education with the industry needs and creating support structures for start-ups which will assist start-ups with commercialization, business planning, workforce preparation, facilities, etc.
- Grow visitors and visitor spending by raising the profile of WNY as a national and international destination; connect multiple tourist destinations in WNY; improve the profile of the WNY Gateway to the United States.

For more information on the Western New York Regional Economic Development Council please go to <http://regionalcouncils.ny.gov/content/western-new-york>.

2. The extent to which an award of Fund Benefits would be consistent with the strategies and priorities of the Regional Economic Development Council (“REDC”) having responsibility for the region in which an Eligible Project is located.<sup>2</sup> The Finger Lakes Regional Economic Development Council which is responsible for Eligible Projects in Orleans and Genesee Counties Strategies & Priorities can be found at: <http://regionalcouncils.ny.gov/content/finger-lakes>.
3. The number of jobs that would be created as a result of an award of Fund Benefits.
4. The applicant’s long term commitment to the region as evidenced the current and/or planned capital investment in applicant’s facilities in the region.
5. The ratio of the number of jobs to be created to the amount of Fund Benefits requested.
6. The types of jobs that would be created, as measured by wage and benefit levels, security and stability of employment.
7. The amount of capital investment, including the type and cost of buildings, equipment and facilities, proposed to be constructed, enlarged or installed.

---

<sup>2</sup> As provided for in EDL § 189-c(4), criteria 2-15 are adapted from the criteria for eligibility for Expansion Power, Replacement Power and Preservation Power under Public Authorities Law § 1005. The specific criteria identified in PAL § 1005(13)(b)(4)-(5) are relevant to power allocations under these programs but do not have any logical application to allocations of Fund Benefits. Therefore, the Board does not expect to use these criteria to evaluate applications for Fund Benefits. Additionally, in accordance with PAL § 1005(13), criteria 13-15 listed herein will only be used in the case of Eligible Projects which are proposed by Applicants as, and determined by the Board to be, “revitalization” projects.

8. The extent to which an award of Fund Benefits would affect the overall productivity or competitiveness of the applicant and its existing employment.
  9. The extent to which an award of Fund Benefits may result in a competitive disadvantage for other business in the State.
  10. The growth potential of the applicant's facilities and the contribution of economic strength to the area in which the applicant's facilities are or would be located.
  11. The extent of the applicant's willingness to satisfy affirmative action goals.
  12. The extent to which an award of Fund Benefits is consistent with state, regional and local economic development strategies and priorities and supported by local units of government in the area in which the business is located.
  13. The impact of an award of Fund Benefits on the operation of any other facilities of the applicant, and on other businesses within the region.
  14. That the business is likely to close, partially close or relocate resulting in the loss of a substantial number of jobs.
  15. That the applicant is an important employer in the community and efforts to revitalize the business are in long-term interests of both employers and the community.
  16. That a reasonable prospect exists that the proposed award of Fund Benefits will enable the applicant to remain competitive and become profitable and preserve jobs for a substantial period of time.
- 
-