



**Date:** July 26, 2016

**To:** THE TRUSTEES

**From:** THE PRESIDENT and CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

**Subject:** Procurement Services Contract -  
White Plains Office New Centroplex  
Garage Project - Contract Award

### SUMMARY

The Trustees are requested to approve the award of a 5-year contract to Walker Parking Consultants (Walker) of New York, NY in the amount of \$746,839.00 to perform The New Centroplex Garage Project (the "Project") at the White Plains Office (the "Facility"). These services will be part of a Capital Expenditure Authorization Request ("CEAR") expected to be presented in late 2017 when construction bids are received. The total Project is estimated at approximately \$8 million.

### BACKGROUND

Section 2879 of the Public Authorities Law and the Authority's Guidelines for Procurement Contracts require the Trustees' approval for procurement contracts involving services to be rendered for a period in excess of one year.

The Authority's Expenditure Authorization Procedures (EAP) requires the Trustees' approval for an award of personal services contracts exceeding one year in duration or in excess of \$1 million.

The President and Chief Executive Officer, in accordance with the Authority's Expenditure Authorization Procedures, approved preliminary funding in the amount of \$366, 766 in 2016 to begin engineering for the project. Authorization of the balance for this contract services will be sought as preliminary funding in 2017, followed by presentation of the overall CEAR and award of the construction contract(s) in 2017.

### DISCUSSION

The Facility has been undergoing annual repairs since 2011 under contracted work which included Phases 1 through 3 waterproofing, plank repair and beam repairs. Due to increasing repairs, scope and annual expenditures of over \$1M, an assessment was performed in 2014 to identify the root cause of deterioration. As a result of the assessment, Capital Improvements and a 5 year rehabilitation program were approved by the Executive Management Committee (EMC) in March of 2015. The work under this Contract award request is for design services of a new roof over the existing structure, rehabilitation of existing structure deficiencies and an addition of 120 spaces, as approved by the EMC. Design and construction is expected to be completed by 2021.

## EVALUATION

In response to the Authority's Request for Proposal (**Q16-6042HM**) advertised in the New York State *Contract Reporter* on March 24, 2016, one hundred and twenty-four (124) firms downloaded the bid document. On April 20, 2016, eight (8) proposals were received. Following clarifications with the bidders, the final bids are listed below:

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>City, State</b>	<b>Bid</b>	<b>Total Award</b>
Ray Engineers, PC (Ray)	New York, NY	\$388,700.00	\$488,700.00
Greenman Pedersen, Inc. (GPI)	Montebello, NY	\$600,000.00	\$700,000.00
<b>Walker Parking Consultants (Walker)</b>	<b>New York, NY</b>	<b>\$646,839.00</b>	<b>\$746,839.00</b>
Ryan Biggs/Clark Davis/Lothrop Associates (RCL)	Clifton Park, NY	\$680,000.00	\$780,000.00
Environetics Group Architects PC	Engelwood Cliffs, NJ	\$768,600.00	\$868,600.00
EI Team, Inc.	Buffalo, NY	\$969,324.00	\$1,069,324.00
Thornton Tomasetti	New York, NY	\$998,726.80	\$1,098,726.80
EDG	New York, NY	\$1,285,000.00	\$1,385,000.00
<b>Fair Cost Estimate (FCE)</b>			<b>\$ 915,000.00</b>

The four lowest cost proposers were interviewed on June 1, 2016 to review the approach to work, project logistics, cost and schedule and any clarifications for the four bidders.

During the interview, Ray could not demonstrate a good understanding of the sequential steps required for planning and permitting this project and it was apparent that they had insufficient experienced resources for a successful project delivery. As such Ray was not further considered. GPI's proposal was overly focused on garage rehabilitation and the proposed project team has limited experience in design of garages. Walker has a good understanding of the project and a full multi-discipline team of specialists for cost engineering, structural engineering, design packages and permitting. Walker, as well as their sub-consultant, presented over a dozen new and modernized garage projects including facilities located in White Plains and Westchester County. From the interview and presentations it was apparent that Walker had the most relevant experience and capability of performing this project. RCL was not further considered based on higher pricing and comparable qualifications.

Based on the interview, the cost proposal, the approach to work and the relevant experience, the Evaluation Committee deemed Walker as the most responsive and technically acceptable bidder. Walker has been in business for over 50 years and submitted a proposed MWBE plan exceeding the Authority's 30% goal. Walker meets all the requirements of the bidding documents.

The Evaluation Committee recommends awarding a 5-year contract to Walker, the most technically qualified and experienced bidder for the reasons stated above. Walker's bid is consistent with the fair cost estimate and has taken no commercial exceptions.

#### FISCAL INFORMATION

Payments associated with this project will be made from the Authority's Capital Fund budgeted for 2016 through 2021.

#### RECOMMENDATION

The Senior Vice President and Chief Engineer – Operations Support Services, the Vice President – Project Management, the Vice President – Engineering, the Vice President – Procurement, and the Facilities Manager – White Plains Office recommend that the Trustees approve the award of a five year contract to Walker Parking Consultants of New York, NY in the amount of \$746,839.00 for the White Plains Office New Centroplex Garage Project.

For the reasons stated, I recommend the approval of the above-requested action by adoption of the resolution below.

Gil C. Quiniones  
President and Chief Executive Officer

## RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, That pursuant to the Guidelines for Procurement Contracts adopted by the Authority and the Authority's Expenditure Authorization Procedures, approval is hereby granted to award a 5-year contract to Walker Parking Consultants of New York, NY in the amount of \$746,839.00 for the White Plans Office New Centroplex Garage Project, as recommended in the foregoing memorandum of the President and Chief Executive Officer.

**Contractor**

**Walker Parking Consultants  
New York, NY**

**(Q16-6042HM)**

**Contract Approval**

**5-Years**

**\$746,839.00**

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Chairman, the Vice Chairman the President and Chief Executive Officer, the Chief Operating Officer and all other officers of the Authority are, and each of them hereby is, authorized on behalf of the Authority to do any and all things and take any and all actions and execute and deliver any and all agreements, certificates and other documents to effectuate the foregoing resolution, subject to the approval of the form thereof by the Executive Vice President and General Counsel.